

GUIDELINES FOR REVIEWING A CORE READING PROGRAM RUBRIC

Mirrors and Windows Grade 6

Directions for use:

- Thoroughly review the core reading program using the corresponding rubric.
- Only evaluate the individual components that correlate with the grade level to review. *(Note the placement of the “x” within the grade level columns.)*
- Each indicator must receive a score using the following criteria:
 - 2 – Exceeds expectations
 - 1 – Meets expectations
 - 0 – Does not meet expectations*(For any indicator receiving a 0, comments must be provided justifying the score.)*
- Record the total score for each area in the final row for the section.



The Reviewing a Reading Program Professional Development Participant's Guide publication was created for the Center on Instruction by the Florida Center for Reading Research at Florida State University. The Center on Instruction is operated by RMC Research Corporation in partnership with the Florida Center for Reading Research at Florida State University; Instructional Research Group; Lawrence Hall of Science at the University of California – Berkeley; Texas Institute for Measurement, Evaluation, and Statistics at the University of Houston; and The Meadows Center for Preventing Educational Risk at the University of Texas at Austin.

Guideline forms excerpted from *Reviewing a Reading Program Professional Development Module, Participant's Guide*, 2008, Center on Instruction.

The contents of the module and this document were developed under cooperative agreement S283B050034 with the U.S. Department of Education. However, these contents do not necessarily represent the policy of the Department of Education, and you should not assume endorsement by the Federal Government.

INSTRUCTIONAL DESIGN (ID)	K	1	2	3	4	5	6	Score	Comments (examples, strengths, concerns, questions)
1. Is there empirical research on this program's efficacy?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	1	There is research on the <i>methods</i> used but not on the actual program itself. (There is "said" research mentioned on pg T46.)
2. Are resources available to help the teacher understand the rationale for the instructional approach and program strategies (e.g., articles, explanations in the teacher manuals, references, and reliable websites)?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	2	
3. Does the comprehensive program address the five components of reading (phonological/phonemic awareness, phonics, fluency, vocabulary and comprehension)?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	1	Addresses all but phonological awareness. For some students who are still struggling with decoding, we need <u>something</u> in the core text on phonics for teachers to use. Many 6th grade teachers do not have any phonics resources & need them.
4. In addition to the five components of reading, are other dimensions of reading such as spelling, writing, oral language, and listening comprehension addressed?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	2	Lots of language arts skills. Language, writing, and reading complement each other in a unit.
5. Is there a scope and sequence?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	2	
6. Are goals and objectives clearly stated?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	2	
7. Are student materials aligned with instructional objective of the lesson?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	2	
8. Do instructional materials increase in difficulty as students' skills strengthen?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	0	Materials increase independence rather than difficulty.
9. Are all lessons and activities (e.g., whole group, small group, and centers) reading-related?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	1	Activities involve reading, but are primarily only reading for comprehension.
10. Is there a clear and logical organization to the lessons in:									
The order and procedures of each day's lesson?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	2	Less guidance on how specifically to teach each day. Not a scripted program.
The inclusion of all necessary materials?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	2	Some of the materials need to be more explicit to support student learning. Very direct and to the point.
The consistency of each day's lesson format?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	1	Not seeing a consistent format from day to day.
Addressing the components of reading every day?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	1	Comprehension and vocabulary are the only components that are addressed every day.
11. Is instruction consistently explicit? Is it	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	1	

concise, specific, and related to the objective?									
12. Are teacher directives highly detailed to ensure accurate implementation?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	0	No explicit directives. Leaves a lot of “wobble room” for teachers.
13. Does the lesson format facilitate frequent interactions between teacher and students?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	2	There are many notes per selection for the teacher’s use to aid in student understanding.
14. Is instruction consistently systematic? Is there a prescribed order for introducing specific skills within each component of reading?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	1	Not consistent or systematic. Two people could teach this program in a very different manner because there are few specific directives. Some teachers will prefer this, but does it leave things too “wide open” and thereby miss the goal of a “core text” providing consistent instruction?
15. Are there coordinated instructional sequences and instructional routines which include:									
Modeling?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	1	
Guided practice with feedback?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	1	Guided practice; less on the feedback end. Feedback would have to be completely teacher created.
Student practice and application?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	1	Hard to tell without all the booklets, CD’s etc.
Cumulative review?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	1	The cumulative review is more skill-based rather than based on the actual selections read.
16. Are there many guided practice opportunities for explicit teaching and teacher-directed feedback (for typically progressing readers and more for struggling readers)?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	0	More practice opportunities in supplemental work. Not sure that there’s much on the teacher-directed feedback end and none shown in the teacher’s guide. This is a weak area.
17. Does the program provide clear guidance for the teacher to document student progress and inform instruction?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	0	None found.
18. Does instruction make a clear connection among all five components?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	0	No examples of where any one component leads to an understanding or a connection with any other component. Phonics isn’t taught, thus not all 5 components. See #10d
19. Is scaffolding a prominent part of the lessons?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	0	The program boasts that the units are scaffolded so that students move to working independently by the end of the unit, but it’s not prominent. Not sure it will be that effective in the end.
20. Are instructions for scaffolding specific within each lesson?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	0	No. There is a general guide to how the lessons are scaffolded in the teacher notes at the beginning of the book, but it is

									not direct. Teachers could interpret differently.
21. Are teachers encouraged to give immediate, specific feedback (corrective or positive)?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	1	Not many opportunities for this. (If utilizing the very few questions after a reading selection qualifies as this, then yes.)
22. Is differentiated instruction prominent?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	1	Lots of sources and suggestions for how to make this work but they are supplemental materials rather than included in the textbook itself.
23. Is instruction differentiated based on assessment?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	0	It can be, but since the students are only being assessed on skills twice a year, it doesn't seem that it is possible to base instruction on assessment at all. This program did not do a good job of linking assessment to instruction.
24. Are directions for differentiating instruction specific?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	1	Not specific, but included.
25. Is small-group instruction (small teacher-pupil ratio) part of daily instruction?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	0	The breakdown of guided reading and directed reading books per unit seemed organized so teacher can assign stories per group--but it is not explicitly stated to organize into small groups for instruction. Seems more a whole-group program, based on the teacher's annotated book.
26. Are there guidelines for forming flexible groups based on student progress?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	0	No evidence.
27. Are enrichment activities included for advanced students?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	2	They seem simple enough that it would be easy to push a more "general" student into those advanced categories.
28. Does the program provide instruction for English Learners?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	1	There are additional supports for EL students in a supplemental book.
29. Does the program specify for whom it is appropriate (e.g., students on or above grade level, students slightly behind their peers, students more than one grade level behind their peers)?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	1	The scope and sequence guide identifies reading support/reading level as easy, moderate, or hard, but it would be more helpful for a teacher if there was an actual scale (ie: lexile level) included. The selections do not include a wide enough range of levels and more selections are needed for lower readers. Some of the supplemental sources do include grade-level information.
30. Does the program specify who should provide instruction for accurate implementation (e.g., special education teacher, general education teacher, paraprofessional, or volunteer)?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	0	No - it seems implied that the general education teacher will be doing all of the instruction. All seems teacher led - no small groups or other formats.
31. Does the program specify the instructional setting (e.g., general education classroom,	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	0	No - it seems implied that the setting is the general education classroom, but offers a

computer lab, or resource room)?									lot online where you would need a computer lab or 1-1 technology.
TOTAL									34

PHONICS (P)	K	1	2	3	4	5	6	Score	Comments (examples, strengths, concerns, questions)
1. Is phonics instruction explicit ?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	0	No link to phonics skills in this entire program, other than one spelling lesson (#2).
2. Is phonics instruction systematic ?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	0	No link to phonics skills in this entire program, other than one spelling lesson (#2).
3. Does phonics instruction include coordinated instructional sequences and routines ?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	0	No link to phonics skills in this entire program, other than one spelling lesson (#2).
4. Is phonics instruction scaffolded ?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	0	No link to phonics skills in this entire program, other than one spelling lesson (#2).
5. Does phonics instruction include cumulative review ?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	0	No link to phonics skills in this entire program, other than one spelling lesson (#2).
6. Are assessments included to measure and monitor progress in phonics?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	0	No link to phonics skills in this entire program, other than one spelling lesson (#2).
7. Are symbol to sound (decoding) and sound to symbol (spelling) taught explicitly?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	0	Does not provide enough to “meet the expectation” and therefore, isn’t explicit. The entire program has one lesson on decoding consonant/vowel sounds (Lesson 2). This is a skill that students would have seen prior to grade 6, but it may need to be emphasized as students begin to see the transition from decoding to spelling.
8. Is spelling taught during word learning so students can understand how sounds map onto print?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	0	Spelling seems to be a completely separate component, one that is not linked to the day’s activities or other learning.
9. Does instruction progress from simple to more complex concepts (e.g., CVC words before CCCVCC words and single syllable words before multisyllabic words)?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	1	Syllables are not addressed until Unit 6 and there are only three, two-page lessons on using syllables to help students spell words. This is certainly not a strong point of this program.
10. Are reviews of previously taught concepts and words frequent and cumulative?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	0	Since it’s taught once, it can’t really be reviewed. It seems previously taught concepts are not reviewed.
11. Is emphasis placed on fluency practice for	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	0	There is not enough emphasis on phonics

each phonics component (e.g., sound identification, CVC blending, word recognition, multisyllabic words, and text reading)?									to warrant a “meets expectation” for fluency within phonics instruction. In this program, fluency seems to be a matter of reading a random selection a few times; it is not linked to phonics components.
12. Are students taught the strategy of chunking when trying to decode multisyllabic words?		X	X	X	X	X	X	1	Students are introduced to word parts in two or three spelling/vocabulary supplements.
13. Does the program provide teacher modeling of a think-aloud strategy to aid in multisyllabic word analysis?		X	X	X	X	X	X	0	Could not find this at all in the spelling/vocabulary resources. Did not see any think aloud strategies.
14. Are students taught strategies to read multisyllabic words by using prefixes, suffixes, and known word parts?		X	X	X	X	X	X	1	Syllabification is addressed in one lesson in the spelling and vocabulary supplements.
15. Is instruction explicit in the use of syllable types (e.g., open, closed, vowel-consonant-e, vowel combinations, r-controlled, and consonant-le)?		X	X	X	X	X	X	0	I could not find this at all in the spelling/vocabulary resources. (There were places in the lessons where a teacher could “reach” for this, but it is not explicit enough.)
16. Is a section of the program devoted to advances phonics (structural analysis) skills?			X	X	X	X	X	0	Students are introduced to word parts in a minimal amount of the spelling and vocabulary supplements. Did not find word analysis.
17. Are advanced phonics skills taught explicitly, first in isolation and then in words and connected texts?			X	X	X	X	X	0	Did not find skills in isolation, nor connected to the texts.
18. Does the program include spelling strategies (e.g., word sorts, categorization activities, word-building activities, and word analogies)?		X	X	X	X	X	X	0	No specific spelling strategies or rules in this program, not enough to build on.
19. Is instruction in the meaning of roots and affixes explicit and do students analyze the relationship of spelling to meaning of complex words?				X	X	X	X	1	There are one or two lessons on this. Definitely not ample. The lesson merely lists a sampling of prefixes and suffixes and gives the students the meaning with an example; the worksheet had the students use these to write out meanings of words.
20. Are word parts that occur with high frequency (e.g., un-, re-, in-, and -ful) taught rather than those that occur only in a few words?		X	X	X	X	X	X	0	Can't say word parts are actually “taught” at all, they are only referenced.
21. Are there activities for distinguishing and interpreting words with multiple meanings?		X	X	X	X	X	X	1	The closest thing here is a lesson on using a dictionary/reference skills.
22. Once advanced phonics strategies have been mastered, are they immediately applied to reading and interpreting familiar and unfamiliar connected texts?		X	X	X	X	X	X	0	This is not practiced. If applied means they are in the story texts - but possibly not addressed.
23. Are words used in advanced phonics		X	X	X	X	X	X	0	Since there are no advanced phonics

activities also found in student texts?									studies, they are not put in the student text. There could be ways of building this in, but that would be entirely up to the teacher , as it is not in the program itself.
TOTAL									5 Very weak in phonics instruction.

FLUENCY (F)	K	1	2	3	4	5	6	Score	Comments <i>(examples, strengths, concerns, questions)</i>
1. Is fluency instruction explicit ?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	0	Didn't find fluency instruction at all. It merely mentions fluency, but does not teach it. If it's not explicitly stated, many teachers will not "figure it out". This series addresses fluency adequately.
2. Is fluency instruction systematic ?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	0	Yes - but with only two passages per unit that are based on stories from the unit, depending on what stories the teacher selects, the students may or may not have been exposed to the selection as a class as well as with the assessment. Again, it leaves too much up to the individual teacher to "figure it out."
3. Does fluency instruction include coordinated instructional sequences and routines ?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	0	Lack of real fluency instruction. Repeated reading of the selection (4x) is not fluency instruction.
4. Is fluency instruction scaffolded ?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	0	Book only includes assessments, not instruction.
5. Does fluency instruction include cumulative review ?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	0	No evidence of cumulative review except for students reading the same passage up to four times. (How many 6th graders are going to stay engaged reading a passage 4 times?)
6. Are assessments included to measure and monitor progress in fluency?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	0	Can't assess what you are not teaching.
7. Does the program address all dimensions of fluency (speed, accuracy, and prosody)?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	0	Without explicit instruction, all dimensions are not addressed.
8. Does the program encourage the teacher to model speed, accuracy, and prosody?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	1	If the teacher uses the audio versions of the stories, they are good examples, but can't say these are encouraged.
9. Does fluency practice during letter-sound study and text reading involve the teacher's providing feedback to students?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	0	There is teacher feedback but it is not related to letter-sound study.
10. Is fluency instruction integrated into each day's lesson?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	0	No -- with only two selections per unit, that would be a maximum of eight days of fluency practice (and I intentionally chose the word practice rather than

									“instruction”). fluency in each days lesson - possibly if it was teacher led - but not in the book.
11. Is the decoding strategy taught so that it becomes automatic?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	0	Do not see where decoding strategies are taught.
12. Are irregular words taught to be recognized automatically?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	0	Do not see where irregular words are addressed.
13. Is there an emphasis on reading multisyllabic words fluently?		X	X	X	X	X	X	1	The first few units worth of fluency assessments do not contain many multisyllabic words, but those toward Units 7 and 8 have several per passage. Question the level of rigor for grade six.
14. Are research-based fluency strategies (e.g., timed readings, peer reading, and repeated readings) included?		X	X	X	X	X	X	1	Just the timed readings component.
15. Is fluency practice introduced after students are proficient at reading words accurately (e.g., in lists, sentences, and passages)?		X	X	X	X	X	X	0	Did not find this.
16. Does fluency practice involve decodable texts (texts that include phonic elements and word types students have previously been taught)?		X	X	X	X	X	X	1	The passages all seemed decodable, but not tied to phonics elements being taught.
17. Are both narrative and expository texts provided for students to read aloud?		X	X	X	X	X	X	2	This is a nice anthology. It is NOT a great comprehensive reading text, because it does not address all components of reading instruction.
18. Are teacher prompts included to encourage students to read aloud in order to determine skills application and accuracy?		X	X	X	X	X	X	0	Teachers generally do this as a matter of practice, but this text does not prompt it. No evidence found of teacher prompts.
19. After error correction, are students asked to reread the word, word list, or sentence correctly and then to reread it from the beginning?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	0	No evidence.
20. Are students given ample practice opportunities to use text at their independent or instructional level to help build fluency?		X	X	X	X	X	X	1	The texts provided are all at the same level - there is no opportunity for differentiation based on the needs of the individual learner.
21. Is the number of texts at each level sufficient to provide adequate practice opportunities?		X	X	X	X	X	X	1	Not at all, however the whole text is angled toward middle school/high school. It seems more geared for higher readers with little to offer lower readers.
22. Does the program clearly show the teacher how to determine independent, instructional, and frustrational reading levels for individual students?		X	X	X	X	X	X	1	The teacher guide to grading the fluency passages shows how to determine the level, but does not show what to do with the level (differentiate).
23. Is there a guide to help teachers calculate fluency rate?		X	X	X	X	X	X	1	Would be helpful if it was in the teacher's guide, as it's only on the website.

24. Do students have opportunities to time themselves and graph results after rereading the same text?			X	X	X	X	X	0	No - but this could easily be done.
25. Are there directions for how to pair students for partner reading?		X	X	X	X	X	X	0	No evidence of use of partner reading explicitly in the program.
26. Are students taught a specific error correction to use when reading with a partner?		X	X	X	X	X	X	0	No evidence of use of partner reading explicitly in the program.
27. Is there continuous progress monitoring of oral reading fluency?		X	X	X	X	X	X	0	Obviously a teacher could do this but no directions given.
28. Is an end-of-the-year fluency goal of correct words per minute given for each grade?		X	X	X	X	X	X	0	Could not find information about fluency goals. Research supports fluency and phonics instruction, practice, and monitoring in upper grades, not just primary grades.
TOTAL								10	Very weak in fluency instruction.

VOCABULARY (V)	K	1	2	3	4	5	6	Score	Comments (e.g., examples, strengths, concerns, questions)
1. Is vocabulary instruction explicit ?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	1	Words are merely defined in the margins and then included on the selection test. A worksheet is included that expands the definitions (Saw some that included synonyms and antonyms).
2. Is vocabulary instruction systematic ?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	1	No method for teaching vocabulary is provided. This book does have a system in place for vocabulary but is not much more than having the "key terms" fit in with the context of the big idea being taught. Words seem to be taught in isolation, with too many at one time for it to be effective.
3. Does vocabulary instruction include coordinated instructional sequences and routines ?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	1	The program does a nice job of selecting vocabulary words that support the learning objectives of each chapter -- for example, the non-fiction unit has words like "memoir" and "persuasive essay".
4. Is vocabulary instruction scaffolded ?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	1	Any scaffolding is minimal...not enough. There seems to be a small progressive level of difficulty as students move to the end of the book. The words seem random.
5. Does vocabulary instruction include cumulative review ?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	0	Words are taught and tested per story rather than with a cumulative review.

6. Are assessments included to measure and monitor progress in vocabulary ?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	0	Only with the unit selection.
7. Is emphasis placed on listening and speaking vocabulary?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	2	
8. Is there emphasis on reading and writing vocabulary?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	2	
9. Are students exposed to diverse vocabulary through listening to or reading narrative and expository texts?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	2	
10. Does the program include frequent use of teacher read-alouds using higher level books with explanation and instruction of key vocabulary?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	1	It doesn't seem explicit that the teacher will be the one reading the stories aloud. There is an audio version of most stories available, but the focus isn't on vocab instruction.
11. Does the program include a variety of texts that allow students ample opportunities to engage in wide reading at their independent levels?		X	X	X	X	X	X	1	
12. Does vocabulary instruction occur before, during, and after reading?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	0	The text calls them "preview," "selection," and "teaching" words, but nothing is done with them.
13. Are a limited number of words selected for robust, explicit vocabulary instruction?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	1	The text makes a big point that the words fit into Isabel Beck's 3 tiers...but there are a TON of words per selection. (For example, Anne Frank's "Why?" on page 287 has 12 vocabulary words for two pages of text.) Students do need to learn many words, but that seems like too many at once.
14. Are important, useful, and difficult words taught?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	1	There are just too many at once.
15. Does the instructional routine for vocabulary include:									
Introducing the word?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	1	The "preview vocabulary" words are defined ahead of time and in the text. The "selection words" and "teaching words" are defined in-text, without a separate definition box and without being bolded or underlined.
Presenting a student-friendly explanation?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	1	The selection words are not defined well in-text and do not have a student friendly definition in any other location.
Clarifying the word with examples?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	0	Little to nothing is clarified with the words.
Checking students' understanding?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	0	Only on the unit test(s).
16. Are ample opportunities provided to engage in oral vocabulary activities that:									

Repeat exposure to words in rich and multiple contexts?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	1	The “key terms” that are related to the type of reading/writing are repeated.
Use everyday language to explain word meanings?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	1	Some - most notably for the words defined in the margins.
Connect word meanings to prior knowledge?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	0	Some, but the vocab doesn’t even seem taught, let alone prior knowledge
17. Are students given multiple opportunities to use new words in reading sentences, paragraphs, or longer texts?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	1	Only the “key terms” and they offer multiple opportunities, but not meaningful ones.
18. Is extended instruction provided in multiple contexts to promote word awareness using word banks, vocabulary logs, writing, semantic maps, concept definition mapping, and word classification?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	1	Each selection uses a different method of expanding the vocabulary knowledge.
19. Are strategies taught over time to ensure understanding and correct application?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	1	
20. Are meanings of prefixes, roots, and suffixes taught before connecting them to words?		X	X	X	X	X	X	1	The text seems to tie this more in with spelling rather than with selections using words with word parts.
21. Is a strategy to determine word meanings based on meanings of prefixes, roots, and suffixes taught?		X	X	X	X	X	X	0	No evidence in teachers manual.
22. Are various aspects of word study included (either under vocabulary or word recognition) such as:									
Concepts of word meaning?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	1	Infrequent but included.
Multiple meanings?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	1	Infrequent but included.
Synonyms?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	1	Infrequent but included.
Antonyms?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	1	Infrequent but included.
Homonyms?		X	X	X	X	X	X	1	Infrequent but included.
Figurative meanings?		X	X	X	X	X	X	1	Infrequent but included.
Morphemic analysis?			X	X	X	X	X	1	Infrequent but included.
Etymologies?				X	X	X	X	1	Infrequent but included.
23. Is dictionary use explicitly taught using grade-appropriate dictionaries?		X	X	X	X	X	X	0	Some but it is limited practice and is not explicitly taught.
24. Is the use of context to gain the meaning of an unfamiliar word kept to a minimum?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	2	
25. Is computer technology used to help teach vocabulary?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	0	There are some on-line resources, but not enough; and they are mostly worksheets. There are no snapshots or references made in the teacher’s guide. Teachers would have to create/do on their own

									quite a bit, which is a negative here.
TOTAL								32	

COMPREHENSION (C)	K	1	2	3	4	5	6	Score	Comments <i>(examples, strengths, concerns, questions)</i>
1. Is comprehension instruction explicit?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	1	There is one small comprehension reading skill addressed for each selection. Not clear how some of the selected skills develop the student as a reader as they don't seem to be emphasized during the reading itself.
2. Is comprehension instruction systematic?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	1	It is embedded in each lesson via the "before reading/during reading/after reading" model. In the margins in the "Use the Model" or "Teach the Model" format and gives prompts along the way for comprehension instruction (blue-bordered insets in margin of selection page).
3. Does comprehension instruction include coordinated instructional sequences and routines?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	1	In this series it's only the Before, During, and After Reading model.
4. Is comprehension instruction scaffolded?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	0	The program says that it's scaffolded so that students have more responsibility in the comprehension pieces at the ends of each unit, but the comprehension instruction is not scaffolded.
5. Does comprehension instruction include cumulative review?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	1	Not of the selections provided. There is a more skill-based unit test. End-of-unit tests are more appropriate than a test over each selection. It assesses skills based on a cold-read, rather than over a piece that has been discussed/taught. It's a good way to practice for ISTEP & other standardized tests, which are always a cold read.
6. Are assessments included to measure and monitor progress in comprehension?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	1	There are comprehension worksheets and tests for each reading selection.
7. Is learning to determine which strategy to use and why (metacognition) part of instruction?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	0	The logic behind the selected strategy for any particular text is not presented and/or taught to the students.
8. When a strategy is taught, is it applied frequently so students understand its usefulness?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	0	It is applied to one selection, but not frequently.
9. Are students asked to apply previously learned strategies to new texts?		X	X	X	X	X	X	1	More teacher-focused, not student-focused.

10. Is appropriate text provided for students to practice applying strategies?		X	X	X	X	X	X	1	
11. Does program instruction enable students to establish and adjust purposes for reading (e.g., reading to understand, interpret, inform, to enjoy, and to solve problems)?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	2	Based on how the book is organized, if it is followed in somewhat of the order given, this would be easy to accomplish.
12. Does instruction support the use of multiple, coordinated comprehension strategies?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	1	
13. Are guided and supported cooperative learning groups suggested as an instructional technique?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	0	It does not explicitly lead the teacher to do small groups, but the selections with the blue sides could be used with a group after the teacher guides through the red.
14. Does instruction begin with the use of short passages?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	0	The instruction generally begins with the longest passage for the unit.
15. Does instruction emphasize that students have a conceptual understanding of beginning, middle, and end?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	1	Some selections have good after-reading questions that support this; other selection questions do not support this concept.
16. Does the program provide prompts for the teacher to guide the students through texts using think-alouds?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	0	There are definitely good prompts throughout each selection, but no "think aloud".
17. Are models of effective questioning techniques (e.g., Bloom's taxonomy) provided to guide and monitor students' comprehension?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	2	
18. Are there ample opportunities for students to listen to narrative and expository text?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	2	This is a strength of this program.
19. Is instruction in narrative and expository text structures explicit?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	2	With the inclusion of the two pages before the unit that teach key words, this helps make the purpose explicit and explain the features of particular types of writing.
20. Are there ample opportunities for students to read narrative and expository texts at independent and instructional levels?		X	X	X	X	X	X	1	This program does provide ample opportunity for students to read at their independent and instructional levels because selections in the text don't include a wide enough range of lexile levels. This would have to be done by the teacher using other materials (not provided in this textbook).
21. Is there a variety of narrative and expository books at the appropriate readability level for student practice?		X	X	X	X	X	X	1	The website shows two for each grade level, but don't know if more are available. At the end of each unit suggestions on other related books are provided, but not clear if those are components of the program or just suggestions. Teachers will have to put in more of their own time

									& effort to use these resources & it would have been much better to include varied levels of text in the core textbook.
22. Do texts contain useful and familiar concepts and vocabulary?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	2	
23. Are there instructional routines for comprehension strategies for use before, during, and after reading (e.g., prediction, story grammar, summarization, graphic organizers)?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	2	A strength of this program!
24. Is the "main idea" strategy taught systematically (e.g., using pictures, then individual sentences, then paragraphs, etc.)?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	1	Didn't see the term "main idea" used at all. Definitely not taught systematically.
25. Once students have grasped the concept of "main idea," are more complex texts used in which the main idea is not explicit?		X	X	X	X	X	X	0	Didn't see the term "main idea" used at all.
26. Are elements of story grammar (e.g., setting, characters, important events, etc.) taught and used for retelling a story?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	2	
27. Does instruction focus on discussion story grammar and comparing stories?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	1	
28. Is story grammar introduced systematically, beginning with simple text that gradually becomes more complex?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	0	Story grammar not introduced systematically.
29. Are students taught to use graphic organizers to illustrate relationships among concepts in text (e.g., story maps, Venn diagrams, and semantic maps)?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	1	
30. Are conventions of expository text (e.g., chapter headings, charts, and graphs) taught?		X	X	X	X	X	X	2	
31. Are explicit strategies for interpreting information from charts, graphs, tables, and diagrams taught?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	1	Seemed they are more taught as vocabulary words rather than as complex concepts that students need to understand.
32. After instruction, is there systematic review of:									
Literal comprehension?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	1	Minimally. A few stories that really lack this element.
Retelling?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	0	Rarely see the use of retelling or main idea as a component.
Main idea?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	0	Rarely see the use of retelling or main idea as a component. Main idea isn't defined in the back of the book either.
Summarization?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	1	"Summary" isn't even defined in the back of the book with other literary terms. It is

									simply mentioned in Unit 1 and it is included in the end-of-unit tests.
33. Does the program provide instruction for students to become self-directed in using comprehension strategies (e.g., rereading, paraphrasing, making explicit connections from text to prior knowledge, underlining and note-taking, and visualizing relationships and events in the text)?		X	X	X	X	X	X	2	The gradual release of responsibility model drives the whole program (guided-directed-independent).
TOTAL								35	

STANDARDS ALIGNMENT	K	1	2	3	4	5	6	Score	Comments (examples, strengths, concerns, questions)
1. Is clear alignment provided to the Common Core State Standards?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	1	This book is similar to the book being used by 6th graders right now. Not clearly aligned with CCSS yet.
2. Is clear alignment provided to the Indiana Academic Standards?			X	X	X	X	X	1	It seems like some of the IAS are not covered -- instead they list other ways to do this.
TOTAL								2	

MOTIVATION AND ENGAGEMENT (M&E)	K	1	2	3	4	5	6	Score	Comments (examples, strengths, concerns, questions)
1. Does the program direct the teacher in ways to increase student motivation such as:									
2. Making reading relevant to students' lives?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	1	This is supported by the variety of texts provided, but isn't necessarily explicit. The emphasis on making connections also supports this.
3. Providing meaningful goals for learning from texts?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	1	Evidence found in the non-fiction as a whole rather than any other section.
4. Making available a variety of choices (e.g., texts and assignments) that align with instruction?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	2	
5. Providing opportunities for students to work collaboratively?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	1	Don't see this as an explicit component of the program, but do see ways that it could be included. Again, this is more up to the teacher & not really driven by this text.
TOTAL								5	

ASSESSMENT (A)	K	1	2	3	4	5	6	Score	Comments <i>(examples, strengths, concerns, questions)</i>
1. Are assessments included that teachers can use to guide student movement through the program (e.g., screening, progress monitoring, diagnostic, and outcome measures)?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	1	Assessments are included, but the teacher's manual does not give good guidance or support for using the assessments to guide student movement through the program. This item is given a weak "1".
2. Does the program provide teacher guidance in using assessment results to differentiate instruction?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	1	Assessments are included, but the teacher's manual does not give good guidance or support for using the assessments to guide student movement through the program. This item is given a weak "1".
3. Do the assessments identify students who are at risk or already experiencing difficulty learning to read?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	1	The fluency assessment could do this more than anything else.
TOTAL								3	

PROFESSIONAL DEVELOPMENT (PD)	K	1	2	3	4	5	6	Score	Comments <i>(examples, strengths, concerns, questions)</i>
1. Is adequate time offered for teachers to learn new concepts and practice what they have learned?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	0	Unclear as to any guidelines regarding time allowed for teachers to learn/practice using it.
2. Is there a plan for coaches, mentors, peers, or outside experts to provide feedback to teachers and follow-up assistance as they put new concepts into practice?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	1	The company offers training and support for the first year of adoption, according to materials provided.
3. Are teachers taught how to administer and interpret assessments that accompany the program?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	1	Somewhat. The program assumes that teachers can interpret data and categorize students on their own.
4. Is program PD customized to meet participants' varying needs (e.g., first-year teachers, coaches, and principals)?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	1	Every teacher does it the same way
5. Does the PD provide support (e.g., principal checklists, follow-up, in-class modeling, and a CD for viewing model lessons) to facilitate application of content?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	0	Unsure based on information provided.
								3	